

**CITY OF SAN GABRIEL**

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING  
AND THE  
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION**

**November 9, 2015**

**The regular meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Gabriel was held in the City Council Chambers at City Hall, 425 S. Mission Drive, San Gabriel, California, on Monday, November 9, 2015.**

Chairman Garden called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. and led the pledge of allegiance.

**Meeting Called to Order;  
Pledge of Allegiance**

**ROLL CALL**

**ROLL CALL**

**PRESENT:**

**PLANNING COMMISSION:**

Chairman Norman Garden, Vice-Chair Thomas Klawiter, Commissioner Jingbo Lou, Commissioner Camelia Vera and Commissioner Vince Zawodny

**DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION:**

Chairperson Marla Nadolney, Vice-Chair Raymond Cheng

**ABSENT:**

None

**STAFF PRESENT:**

City Attorney Robert L. Kress, Planning Manager Mark Gallatin, Associate Planner Larissa De La Cruz, Assistant Planner, Fang-zhou Zhou and Planning Commission Secretary Jackie Wong

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Chairman Garden asked that speakers come forward who wish to address the Planning Commission on non-agenda items.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

None.

No one came forward to speak; therefore, he closed this portion of the meeting.

**EXPLANATION OF PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURES**

City Attorney Kress explained the public hearing procedures for the items on this evening's agenda.

**EXPLANATION OF PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURES**

**Explained by City Attorney Kress**

**PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**

- 1. 237 E. Las Tunas Dr.  
Planning Case No. PL-15-003  
Applicant: Priya Sakhrani**

This item was continued from the October 12, 2015 regular Planning Commission meeting to allow staff to further research concerns about parking, neighborhood compatibility, and ambulance calls. Assistant Planner Fang-zhou Zhou presented this item regarding a CUP for the construction of a kidney dialysis center in the C-1 (Retail Commercial) zone and for a 20 percent reduction in the number of required parking spaces from 35 to 28 spaces.

**PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS**

- 1. 237 E. Las Tunas Dr.  
Planning Case No.  
PL-15-003  
Applicant: Priya Sakhrani  
Approved.**

**ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:** The project was reviewed for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) is required as determined by staff. A Notice of Proposed MND of Environmental Impact was prepared and filed with the Los Angeles County Clerk on September 21, 2015.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve Planning Case No. PL-15-003, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Mr. Zhou stated that both staff and the applicant now have additional information regarding parking, ambulance calls and neighborhood compatibility per the Planning Commission's request. The applicant submitted a parking study prepared by KOA consultants. The study, conducted on October 15, 2015, identified that the site has adequate parking supply. Condition of approval #17 was added to prohibit shuttles from traveling on Country Club Dr. from idling in the parking lot or from loading and unloading passengers on the street. Ambulance calls to the applicant's existing dialysis center accounted for less than 1.5% of all such calls in the City last year.

Staff reported no complaints to either the Police Department or the Neighborhood Improvement Services Division about the existing dialysis center. Finally, rather than being implemented in a piece meal fashion when new developments are built, traffic calming measures are intended to be applied on a neighborhood or citywide scale, subject to City Council approval.

Dr. Sakhrani, and Kai Chan, project architect, 10817 Santa Monica Blvd. #300, Los Angeles, presented a short video presentation about the business operation.

#### Testimonies

#### Testimonies

1. Dr. Gary Lerner, 4650 Sunset Blvd., Children's Hospital of Los Angeles, spoke in support of the project and vouched for Dr. Sakhrani's exceptional work ethic. He also emphasized the growing need for dialysis centers due to increased number of patients with kidney disease that affect all ages.
2. Michael Vollaira, 308 E. Norwood Pl., San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. He added that everyone deserves to live.
3. John B. Day, 5530 N. Burton, San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project.
4. Carrie Martin, 1520 S. Charlotte, San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. She stated that she's on dialysis and centers like this are greatly needed.
5. Zulma Espinoza, 475 ½ Santa Ana St., came forward in support of the project.
6. Robert Avila, 132 E. Live Oak St., San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. He stated that Dr. Sakhrani cares for his patients and does a good job.
7. Mauricio Mike, 1708 Jackson Ave., San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. He stated that he likes to stay in San Gabriel for care and the location is close to his house.
8. Dietrich Bradford, 645 E. Queen St., Inglewood, CA, spoke in support of the project. He stated that the dialysis is important and kidney disease can affect anyone: any color or any age.
9. Henry P. Pramov, Jr., 444 S. Flower St., #1700, Los Angeles, lawyer for Dr. Sakhrani, spoke in support of the project. He stated that the concerns regarding traffic, noise and parking have all been addressed. Drivers are professional and won't be driving Country Club Drive erratically. The transportation van company has agreed to eliminate the backup noise on their vans and will provide mirrors in the parking lot. He submitted three letters of support to the Commissioners for their review from: a UCLA physician; a transportation

company; and a letter with 25 neighbors' signatures from Pearl Street, which is located near the other dialysis center that the doctor owns.

10. Virginia Martinez, 132 E. Live Oak, Apt. A, San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. She stated that the doctor takes good care of all his patients including her son.
11. Michael J. Cordero, 2719 Charlotte Ave., Rosemead, spoke in support of the project. He stated that this establishment is not like McDonald's or Jack in the Box. Once patients are done with their treatment, they leave the facility.
12. Jon Delgado, 5218 Acacia St., San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. He stated that everyone deserves equality.
13. Metra Parker, dietician at the dialysis center, spoke in support of the project. She stated that it is not a question of patients wanting to do dialysis but it is a necessity for them to live and be there for their families and children. She added that dialysis is a terrifying ordeal on a continuous basis and people have rights, equality and justice.
14. George Hernandez, 514 Pearl St., San Gabriel, spoke in support of the project. He is a patient of Dr. Sakhrani and said that he hopes to see another center opens so that the doctor can help more people.
15. Vincent Chong, 237 E. Las Tunas Dr., San Gabriel, property owner, spoke in support of the project. He stated that he had the same concerns regarding traffic and noise over the years but has chosen the dialysis center be erected there over other businesses like restaurants. Those types of business create more of those problems in the neighborhood compared to a dialysis center.
16. Deborah Jones, 407 Country Club Dr., San Gabriel, spoke against the project. She was concerned about inadequate parking and hours of operation. She stated that there is not enough parking and that the parking study is inaccurate. The hours of operation are inappropriate in a quiet neighborhood. Vans have backup beepers that disturb the peace in the area. She urged the Commissioners to deny the projects or modify the plans.
17. Steve Kemp, 129 Country Club Dr., San Gabriel, stated that he is in favor of the dialysis center but only if it is built to City Codes. He stated that the plans can't event be built with the requisite number of parking spaces. The dialysis center located on San Gabriel Blvd has more parking spaces than the new proposed center.
18. Lauren Paine, 109 Country Club Dr., San Gabriel, stated that she is in favor of the dialysis center at that location over other things that have been proposed to be erected on that site. She was concerned about the increased traffic on Country Club Drive since they have young kids and that people sometimes turn their cars on their driveway, deeming it unsafe. She was concerned also about the beepers on the vans that will go off at 3 a.m. She also stated that the slamming of car doors multiple times, beeps from locking the cars, and conversations that would occur in the parking lot during very early hours would disturb their sleep. She suggested having the parking lot be modified to address these issues.
19. Rebecca Lee, 119 Alabama St., San Gabriel, stated that she's for the dialysis center. She added that she has a security camera facing the street. She was concerned on how the parking lot has only one way in and one way out and the increased traffic. She added that she would appreciate back up cameras over van beepers to eliminate the noise problem.
20. Charles Cummings, 133 Country Club Dr., San Gabriel, lawyer, spoke on behalf of his neighbors. He stated that he has heard rumors that their opposition is racially motivated. He explained that his family is very diverse and that race is not the issue. He also stated that his

neighbors are Asians. He stated that he used to be a member of the City's Civil Service Commission for six years. He was concerned about traffic, noise, and the hours of operation. He also questioned the findings on the parking study. He recommends reducing the hours of operation and having reasonable number of parking spaces.

21. Chuck Sances, 1808 S. California St., San Gabriel, spoke against the project. He suggested to have underground parking to eliminate traffic and noise issues.
22. Carlos Velasquez, KOA consultant, conducted the parking study. He stated that the study was conducted in coordination with the City. He stated that they surveyed the site at 801 S. San Gabriel Blvd., which has the exact operation as the proposed new project. He stated that the 20% parking reduction is allowed by the Code, wherein the site is near frequent transit service. It is not a perk that the center gets. The center is near three Metro bus stops on Las Tunas. The dialysis center on San Gabriel Blvd. may be smaller in size but the parking study was based on the number of patients and employees and the center's operations.
23. Randye Kay, San Gabriel resident, spoke against the project. She stated that the hours of operation are unreasonable. She's a nurse practitioner and deserves a good night's sleep in order to function well serving her own patients. She would like to maintain her neighborhood being a quiet area.
24. Angela Rubian, 620 Wilcox, Montebello, spoke in support of the project. She was appalled on how others regard human life and what is a little beep when a life is being saved by dialysis treatment.
25. Joh Choi, 110 Alabama St., San Gabriel, spoke against the project. He said that he works in the post office in the City and that his daughters sleep very late at night from studying. He prefers a quiet sleep for his family. He was concerned about the hours of operation and the noise during very early morning hours. He stated that he doesn't want to move away from their neighborhood and would like to stay in the City.
26. John Colias, 327 Country Club Dr., San Gabriel, spoke against the project. He was concerned about potential hazardous waste generated from the center.
27. Eddie Abraham, Glendora resident, spoke in support of the project. He stated that his father was a patient of Dr. Sakhrani and that there has never been any parking issue when at the center. He also stated that Dr. Sakhrani is an exceptional doctor.

There were 12 speaker cards received but those people did not come forward to speak. Eleven were against the project and one in favor.

Dr. Sahkrani came forward to address the following concerns that were brought up:

- All vans are only paid by MediCal;
- There is no law that beepers are required on all vans. Backup cameras are another option;
- The parking study is not flawed;
- This will be the only dialysis center in the country that is being denied, if ever, due to unreasonable concerns;
- The location is acceptable anywhere but Country Club Drive and that people on this street think they are special;
- Hours of operation are similar to any fast food joint but those establishments are always full of cars. To use this argument, he said, is like saying I want to eat to live but no one can give me food; and
- All dialysis centers operate from 4 a.m. to 10 p.m.

No one else spoke. Therefore, Chairman Garden closed the public hearing portion for this item.

Commissioners' Discussion

Commissioner Lou stated that he understands both sides. He added that he visited the site and was concerned about the direct impact on the neighbors' property from cars' headlights very early in the morning. They can shine into the neighbors' rooms. He suggested having some sort of barrier to prevent the lights reflecting into the neighbors' property.

Commissioner Vera stated that she refers to the City's General Plan as her guide when making decisions. She added that she understands kidney disease and that she also wants to preserve the character of the neighborhood and quality of life. She expressed concern about ramifications to the CUP if ever there are complaints about the service vans using backup beepers and creates noise. She also referred to the zoning map and indicated that the property is zoned as retail/commercial. She felt that the dialysis center is not a commercial business that everyone can use or go to. She suggested that the site should be used for economic development where the business can generate tax revenues for the City. She recommended that the dialysis center be built on the south side of Las Tunas where most medical facilities are located and are away from the residential area. She was also concerned about water usage for the dialysis center, the noise impact from the vans' backup beepers, car alarms and locking sounds as well as the reduction of parking spaces.

Commissioner Zawodny stated that he likes the project but does not like the reduction of parking spaces. He suggested that the project be scaled down and provide adequate parking.

Vice-Chair Klawiter agreed with Commissioner Zawodny. He stated that the project has to be the right size for the lot. He added that this is not a cultural issue and that this project is about cars and land.

Chairman Garden stated that this is a very difficult and emotional issue for both applicant and the residents. He was concerned about the hours of operation and the parking issue. He also suggested that the height of the wall be higher to provide buffering to the neighbors to help shield them from the noise and the cars' headlights.

Planning Manager Gallatin stated that the walls could be raised higher to maximize buffering. He referred to the Olson Company project which did a similar wall buffering for their project.

City Attorney Kress stated that the City does not regulate the hours of operation for this type of business. The City does regulate hours of businesses like restaurants, coffee houses and massage parlors. He explained that if the size of the proposed building was reduced to less than 10,000 square feet and met the parking requirement, then it would be Code compliant, will not require a CUP, and could be open 24 hours a day, seven days a week. He also added that if the Commission makes a decision and anyone is dissatisfied with it, they can appeal it to the City Council. He then explained the appeal process.

Chairman Garden made the motion to approve PL-15-003 subject to the recommended conditions of approval. Commissioner Zawodny seconded the motion.

Ayes: Garden, Lou, and Zawodny  
Noes: Klawiter and Vera

3:2 vote. Motion carried.

Commissioners' Discussion

**PREVIEW ITEM: PLANNING COMMISSION AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION**

2. **220 S. San Gabriel Blvd.  
Planning Case No. PL-15-093  
Applicant: Brian Husting (Kollin Altomare Architects)**

This item was presented by Associate Planner Larissa De la Cruz regarding a proposed mixed use development. This project will have 33,755 square feet commercial space, 152 residential units and a 2,700 square feet community center.

Brian Husting, applicant and project architect, gave a presentation to the Commissioners.

Commissioners' Discussion

The Planning Commission and Design Review Commission conceptualized and discussed the proposed project. The Commissioners were concerned about the density and the massing of the project especially that it is right next to an R-1 zone. They suggested that the developer do a community outreach to the neighbors and get feedback as well. They also recommended making the buildings look more open, inviting, and playful.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to discuss, Chairman Garden moved to adjourn to the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission on Monday, December 14, 2015 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, 425 S. Mission Drive, San Gabriel, CA and Chairperson Nadolney moved to adjourn to the Regular Design Review Commission Meeting on Monday, November 23, 2015 at 7 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, 425 S. Mission Drive, San Gabriel, CA.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Planning Commission and Design Review Commission meeting minutes are available on tape and may be reviewed within 90 days after the meeting in the Community Development Department office at City Hall during regular business hours.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Norman Garden, Chairman  
City of San Gabriel  
Planning Commission

\_\_\_\_\_  
Marla Nadolney, Chairman  
City of San Gabriel  
Design Review Commission

ATTEST: \_\_\_\_\_  
Jackie Wong, Secretary  
City of San Gabriel Planning Commission

**PREVIEW ITEM:  
PLANNING COMMISSION  
AND DESIGN REVIEW  
COMMISSION**

2. **220 S. San Gabriel Blvd.  
Planning Case No. PL-15-093  
Applicant: Brian Husting  
(Kollin Altomare Architects)  
Preview Item. No action  
required.**

Commissioners' Discussion

Commissioners' Discussion

- 3. Amendments to the  
Municipal Code Related to  
Regulations Governing  
Landscaping  
Planning Case  
No. PL-15-118  
Applicant: City of San  
Gabriel  
Recommended approval.**

Commissioners' Discussion

**ADJOURNMENT**