

CITY OF SAN GABRIEL

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

March 14, 2016

The regular meeting of the Planning Commission of the City of San Gabriel was held in the City Council Chambers at City Hall, 425 S. Mission Drive, San Gabriel, California, on Monday, March 14, 2016.

Chairman Garden called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. and led the pledge of allegiance.

**Meeting Called to Order;
Pledge of Allegiance**

ROLL CALL

ROLL CALL

PRESENT:

Chairman Norman Garden, Commissioner Jingbo Lou, and Commissioner Camelia Vera

EXCUSED:

Vice-Chair Thomas Klawiter and Commissioner Vincent Zawodny

STAFF PRESENT:

City Attorney Robert L. Kress, Senior Planner Larissa De La Cruz, and Planning Commission Secretary Jackie Wong

CONSENT ITEMS

Minutes of the regular meeting on January 11, 2016.

Chairman Garden moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Lou seconded the motion. There being no objections, the minutes were approved.

CONSENT ITEMS

**Minutes of the regular
Planning Commission meeting
on January 11, 2016
Approved.**

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Chairman Garden asked that speakers come forward who wish to address the Planning Commission on non-agenda items.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

None.

No one came forward to speak; therefore, he closed this portion of the meeting.

EXPLANATION OF PUBLIC HEARING PROCEDURES

City Attorney Kress explained the public hearing procedures for the items on this evening's agenda.

**EXPLANATION OF PUBLIC
HEARING PROCEDURES**

**Explained by City
Attorney Kress**

PUBLIC HEARING ITEM

- 1. 840 Commercial Ave.
Planning Case No. PL-15-128
Applicant: Judy Mena**

This item was presented by Interim Planning Manager Mark Gallatin about a Conditional Use Permit (CUP) request to operate a preschool and Kindergarten school in an existing light industrial building in the M-1 (Light Manufacturing) zone.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

- 1. 840 Commercial Ave.
Planning Case No.
PL-15-128
Applicant: Judy Mena
Denied.**

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: The project was reviewed and exempted for compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requirements, per Guidelines Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities).

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommended denial of Planning Case No. PL-15-128.

Judy Mena, applicant, came forward to address the concerns from staff findings which include land use, traffic and circulation, noise impacts and zoning. She added that she plans to build a wall between her property and the auto shop next to hers for added protection. She stated that many preschools in the area have a long wait list, and that her business would help the San Gabriel community thrive.

Testimonies

1. Isella Bowles, 401 Agostino Rd., San Gabriel, voiced her concerns about potential health hazards to the children, impacts on existing businesses and potential decrease in property values in the area. She also added that there are business owners along Commercial Street that are present in the audience in support to deny this project.
2. Maggie Miranda, 219 S. St. Francis St., San Gabriel, stated traffic and safety issues should not be a great concern at this location. She added that she supports this project and its existing location in El Monte is very well maintained and well run.
3. Steven Villanueva, 1545 Del Prado, Hacienda Heights, voiced his support for the project. He made reference that there is an existing preschool across the street from the auto shop he used to work at in San Gabriel, and there was never an issues about health hazards to the children. He also stated that traffic at the proposed location should not be a problem and that the City should give Ms. Mena the opportunity to open her business.
4. Alexis Salamanca, 215 S. St. Francis, San Gabriel, supports the project. He stated that as the president of the San Gabriel Chamber of Commerce, he strongly supports small businesses that provide resources to the community. He stated that the preschool would be a great addition to the City's business community.
5. Drew Lawler, Roses Rd., San Gabriel, voiced her concern about how the City has very limited Light Manufacturing zones. Making this location other than M1 would be a big loss for potential industrial business opportunities that could bring more tax dollars to the City. She supports having the preschool open in the City but only to a more suitable location.
6. Jackie, 1820 Alta Vista, Alhambra, stated that she visited Judy's preschool in El Monte and was impressed by the cleanliness of it. She stated that although the new location doesn't look appealing, its location on a cul de sac feels safe to her and her children.
7. Steve, Hacienda Heights resident, stated that Judy has complied with the City's CUP requirements, and that the City should approve her project. He also stated that San Gabriel High School has more traffic around it, and that air quality affects a much greater area than just in the proposed project location.
8. Lucy Garcia, assistant to Ana Maloof, a business owner on Commercial St., San Gabriel, voiced their support for the project. She stated that traffic and noise are not a problem, and the addition of a preschool in this location would add life to the existing businesses there.

Testimonies

Commissioners' Discussion

The Planning Commissioners conceptualized and discussed the project. Commissioners Lou and Vera were concerned about location, land use, traffic circulation, noise, pollution, and the children's safety. Commissioner Vera added that CUP is a privilege and not a right. Chairman Garden was concerned about the children's health and impact on businesses but also sees many benefits to have this project move forward. He added that having the location on a cul de sac would work on the applicant's favor.

Commissioners' Discussion

Commissioner Vera made the motion to accept staff’s recommendation to deny PL-15-128.
Commissioner Lou seconded the motion.

Ayes: Lou and Vera
Noes: Garden

2-1 vote. Motion carried.

STAFF ITEM

1. Annual Reports on General Plan and Housing Element Progress.

Mr. Gallatin presented this item. The Planning Commission agreed to recommend presenting these documents to City Council and then sent to the Governor’s Office of Planning and Research (OPR) and the Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD).

STAFF ITEM

1. Annual Reports on General Plan and Housing Element Progress. Reviewed and Recommended to presented to City Council and sent to OPR and HCD.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to discuss, Chairman Garden moved to adjourn to a Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission on Monday, April 11, 2016 at 6:30 p.m. in the Council Chambers, City Hall, 2nd Floor, 425 S. Mission Drive, San Gabriel, CA.

* * * * *

The Planning Commission meetings are available on tape and may be reviewed within 90 days after the meeting in the Community Development Department office at City Hall during regular business hours.

Chairman Norman Garden
City of San Gabriel
Planning Commission

ATTEST: _____
Jackie Wong, Secretary
City of San Gabriel Planning Commission