

SAN GABRIEL DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING  
MONDAY, JUNE 25, 2018

- **CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Nadolney called the special Design Review Commission meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. on June 25, 2018, in the Council Chamber at City Hall, 425 South Mission Drive, San Gabriel, California, 91776.

- **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Commissioner Cheng.

- **ATTENDANCE:** Chair Nadolney and Commissioner Cheng

Present: Chair Nadolney, Commissioner Cheng, Planning Manager Steinkruger, City Architect Brown, Senior Planner Whipple, Assistant Planner Garibay, Assistant Planner Alvarado, and Design Review Commission Secretary Louie

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Commissioner Cheng moved to approve minutes of the March 26, 2018 meeting of the Design Review Commission. Seconded by Chair Nadolney. Motion passed by a vote of 2 ayes, 0 noes, and 0 abstentions.

3. **CONTINUED BUSINESS**

- A. **188 HAZELL WAY**

- PLANNING CASE NO. SPR17-049 (LARGE SITE PLAN REVIEW)**

- APPLICANT/ DESIGNER: DENISE C. TOMLAN**

- PROJECT SUMMARY:** This is an application for a Large Site Plan Review (SPR). The revised proposed large SPR is a first story addition and new second story on an existing 1,105 square foot residence on a 6,750 square foot lot. The property is zoned R-1 (Single Family Residential) and has a General Plan land use designation of Low Density Residential. This project is exempt from CEQA per Guidelines 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15303, Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

**STAFF RECOMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission APPROVE Planning Case No. SPR17-049 for a Large Site Plan Review at 188 Hazell Way, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Assistant Planner Alvarado presented the staff report.

Commissioner Cheng stated he would like to eliminate the window but appreciated blank wall adjustments for a more pleasing aesthetics.

Architect Tomlan stated house will have a factory finish look including new roof with height reduction.

Chair Nadolney stated it has improved and no glaring issues.

**Commissioner Cheng motion to approve Planning Case No. SPR17-049 with conditions presented by staff and Chair Nadolney seconded the motion.**

#### **4. NEW BUSINESS**

##### **A. 427 NORTH PINE STREET**

**PLANNING CASE NO. SPR-18-010 (LARGE SITE PLAN REVIEW)  
APPLICANT/DESIGNER: STANLEY TSAI**

**PROJECT SUMMARY:** The applicant is requesting a Large Site Plan Review (SPR) to allow for a first story addition and new second story at 427 North Pine Street. The subject site is located in the R-1CC (Single Family Residence Country Club) zone and has a General Plan land use designation of Low Density Residential. This project is exempt from CEQA per Guidelines 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15303, Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission APPROVE Planning Case No. SPA18-010 for a Large Site Plan Review at 427 North Pine Street, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Assistant Planner Garibay presented the staff report.

Planning Manager Steinkruger stated ADU minimum lot size is 6,000 square feet and must comply with FAR and lot coverage. San Gabriel adopted state requirements including parking and setbacks with our own requirements (property owner must live on property and intended for long-term residency).

Commissioner Cheng is concerned with the main house building height in consideration for their neighbors. Chimney will have to be extended since the house height will be extended and it is critical for it to match.

Architect Brown stated the roof should be lowered for a second story and the window has to go up to a maximum on a new height ceiling.

Architect Tsai stated no change will be made to the original style shingle roofing or chimney. All additions will match existing conditions including height roof slope. The fence and gate will stay the same. The backyard is hardscape and will add trees but remove the front tree. Will provide permeable paving next time when it is completed.

Planning Manager Steinkruger suggested adding a landscape condition and looking at the tree removal again.

Commissioner Cheng questioned which front door is proposed to be rendered and where the front entrance would be.

Chair Nadolney stated the rendering in the package shows that it is a working window and emphasized replacing all windows to match.

Architect Tsai stated the window facing the street is an existing window and will match the exterior front elevation.

Commissioner Cheng stated a resident emailed their concerns on privacy issues.

Assistant Planner Garibay stated residential concerns were welcomed and notified with 300 square foot notices. Only one concerned email received from a resident.

Commissioner Cheng requested the final landscape design be sent to the city landscape architect for privacy issues and potentially replacing the tree on the lot.

Architect Brown stated concern about scaling details since not all the gables are drawn to match and clarified the location of the brick. Emphasized consistency as the north and south elevation appear to be different heights.

**Commissioner Cheng moved to approve Planning Case SPR18-010 with staff recommendation and whole recommendations that were previously spoken tonight and for the landscaping requirement (including windows roofline,**

**privacy concern, window uniformity, chimney) Chair Nadolney seconded the motion.**

**B. 353 ALABAMA STREET**

**PLANNING CASE NO. PL-17-037 (LARGE SITE PLAN REVIEW)**

**Applicant/Designer: Alex Ngo**

**PROJECT SUMMARY:** This is an application for a large Site Plan Review (SPR). The proposed SPR would allow for an addition of 525 square feet to an existing 2,102 square foot single story home and construction of a new 1,230 square foot second story on a 16,163 square foot lot. The property is zoned R-1CC (Single Family Residence – Country Club) and has a General Plan land use designation of Low Density Residential. This project is exempt from CEQA per Guidelines 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and 15303, Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission APPROVE Planning Case No. PL-17-037 for a Large SPR, subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Senior Planner Whipple presented the staff report.

Commissioner Cheng emphasized it meets all requirements it will change the neighborhood character. The code does not forbid two-story housing.

Resident Burton (419 Alabama Street) against project because of construction and "mansionization."

Architect Ngo stated the garage driveway exceeds hardscape maximum and as more square footage is added it takes up a lot of green space the back.

Chair Nadolney stated the possibilities of lowering the ceiling and the window layout in the bathroom and closets. Overall, the landscaping looks great.

Architect Ngo stated a new roof with exterior stucco wall will match the current.

Commissioner Cheng suggested lowering ceiling and configuration of the second story but overall the quality of material selected is good.

Landscape Architect confirmed hardscape plans will be colorful and include sitting area in the courtyard. The older tree will remain and the front portion of the paving will be repaved.

Resident Eto (323 Alabama Street) against project due to construction noise. Stated the only reason they know is because of the window post.

Planning Manager Steinkruger stated to contact Neighborhood Improvement Services with construction hour concerns. Project information can be found on the city website. City Council sets the parameters for the 300 foot radius.

**Commissioner Cheng motioned to move Planning Case No. PL-17-037 to August 27<sup>th</sup>. Nadolney seconded the motion.**

**C. 220 SOUTH SAN GABRIEL BOULEVARD  
PLANNING CASE NO. PL-16-0162 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN-UPDATE)  
APPLICANT/DESIGNER: KOLLIN ALTOMARE ARCHITECTS**

**PROJECT SUMMARY:** This is an application for a Planned Development/ Development Agreement (PD/DA), Tentative Tract Map (TTM), and Precise Plan of Design (PPD) for 163 residential units and 34,000 square feet of commercial uses on a 3.59-acre site at 220 South San Gabriel Boulevard. This project is being reviewed pursuant to CEQA.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission provide direction to the applicant on aspects of the design.

Senior Planner Whipple presented the staff report.

Architect Husting stated building heights will be altered and goal is to put A/C and solar on roof. The architecture is urban with a lot of glass and the pedestrian walkway will be determined by Public Works.

Commissioner Cheng emphasized finishing all phases simultaneously. The rail cuts off access forcing entrance by the sidewalk. Encouraged obtaining a national retail or restaurant for more attraction.

Chair Nadolney suggested eliminating 6/7<sup>th</sup> floors, improving the retail signs, and lighting effects with ramps for accessibility. Need a council meeting to make an agreement and possibly have a joint meeting in the next couple of months.

**Commissioner Cheng motioned to move Planning Case No. PL-16-0162 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN-UPDATE) to August 27th. Nadolney seconded the motion.**

**4. STAFF ITEMS**

None

**5. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND CONFERENCE/MEETING REPORTS**

None

**6. ADJOURN DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING**

Chair Nadolney adjourned the Design Review Commission Meeting at 9:21 p.m. to August 27, 2018 at City Hall, 425 South Mission Drive, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Council Chambers.

CITY OF SAN GABRIEL

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
JADEN LOUIE, DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION SECRETARY

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
MARLA NADOLNEY, CHAIR