

SAN GABRIEL DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING
MONDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2019

- **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Cheng called the regular Design Review Commission meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. on November 25, 2019, in the Council Chamber at City Hall, 425 South Mission Drive, San Gabriel, California 91776.

- **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Chairman Cheng.

- **ROLL CALL – DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION**

- **ATTENDANCE**

Present: Chairman Cheng, Vice-Chair Romo, Commissioner Nadolney, Commissioner Sae-Low, Planning Manager Steinkruger, Senior Planner Chang, Secretary Ortiz, and Secretary Wong

Absent: Commissioner Tu

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

2. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

Vice-Chair Romo made a correction to the last paragraph on page three, remove the word “future” and replace it with “during construction”.

Commissioner Nadolney motioned to approve the minutes of the September 23, 2019 meeting of the Design Review Commission as amended. Seconded by Vice-Chair Romo. Motion passed by a vote of 4 ayes, 0 noes.

3. **INTRODUCTION NEW STAFF**

4. **OLD BUSINESS**

The following case was originally heard at the September 23, 2019 Design Review Commission meeting and it was continued to the November 25, 2019 meeting.

- A. **921 SOUTH EUCLID AVENUE
PLANNING CASE NO. PL-15-080 (LARGE SITE PLAN REVIEW)
APPLICANT: EDWIN MAH**

PROJECT SUMMARY: This is an application for a Large Site Plan Review (SPR) to allow construction of a new two-story single-family residence with an attached garage. The subject application was submitted in 2015, prior to the updated R-1 development standards adopted on October 3, 2017. Therefore, the proposed project is subject to the previous R-1 development standards. The subject site is zoned R-1 (Single-Family Residence) and has a General Plan Land Use Designation of Low Density Residential. This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Guidelines Section 15303, Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: RECOMMEND THAT THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION CONTINUE THIS ITEM TO A FUTURE MEETING DATE UNCERTAIN AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT. THE PROJECT WOULD BE RE-NOTICED.

This item was presented by Planning Manager Steinkruger.

Planning Manager Steinkruger stated that Assistant Planner Garibay was informed by the applicant's architect that they need additional time to prepare items for the meeting.

Vice-Chair Romo made the motion to continue this item for a future date. Commissioner Nadolney seconded the motion. Motion passed with a vote of 4 ayes, 0 noes

5. NEW BUSINESS

**A. 116 WEST MARSHALL STREET
PLANNING CASE NO. PPD18-007 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN)
APPLICANT: ERIC TSANG**

PROJECT SUMMARY: This is a request for a Precise Plan of Design (PPD) to construct a seven-unit condominium development. The project site is zoned MU-C/R (Mixed-Use Corridor/Residential) within the Valley Boulevard Specific Plan (VBSP) area and has a General Plan Land Use Designation of Commercial Specific Plan. This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Guidelines Section 15332, Class 32 (In-Fill Development Projects).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT A RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN GABRIEL, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING PLANNING CASE NUMBER PPD18-007 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A SEVEN-UNIT CONDOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT AT 116 WEST MARSHALL STREET, SUBJECT TO THE RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL.

This item was presented by Senior Planner Chang.

Chairman Cheng opened the public hearing.

TESTIMONY:

1. Weng Chang, 118 West Marshall Street, San Gabriel – no position. He had questions regarding the project.

There being no other speaker, Chairman Cheng closed the public hearing.

Mr. Eric Tsang, applicant, 440 East Huntington Drive, Arcadia, came forward and answered the Commissioners' questions.

Chairman Cheng questioned the exterior materials and how they are being put together.

Commissioner Sae-Low had a question regarding the James Hardie detail and asked if it was standard detail.

Mr. Tsang provided the actual sample of James Hardie product and responded the questions regarding exterior building materials.

Chairman Cheng questioned if the windows on the garage level are fixed glass and if there are any openings.

Mr. Tsang confirmed they are fixed windows and that they do not open.

Commissioner Nadolney questioned the slope of the roof screen wall and asked for details because it was not included on the roof plan.

Mr. Tsang explained each unit has a roof deck and the slope is to separate each unit and provide privacy.

Commissioner Nadolney expressed her concern because it is a tall building and asked if there was any way to reduce the building height and suggested to reduce the garage level height.

Mr. Tsang agreed to reduce the garage level height from 9 feet to 8 feet.

Commissioner Nadolney stated she liked the modern design and that details are going to be important. She commented that they need to rethink the 45 degree cut on the roof screen wall, suggesting to cut straight down.

Vice-Chair Romo stated the side of the building has more aesthetic instead of the building frontage. She also indicated the garage doors look really nice but that the front of the building need additional detail.

Mr. Tsang agreed and stated the garage side of the building is more appealing.

Chairman Cheng asked if the front awning could be aesthetically better. He suggested the applicant to work with City staff regarding the front awning design.

Commissioner Sae-Low made a motion to approve PPD18-007 with the added conditions of approval regarding the lowering the garage level height, redesign the rooftop screen wall, and work with City staff regarding the front awning. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Nadolney. Motion passed with a vote of 4-ayes, 0 noes.

**B. 807-811 EAST WELLS STREET
PLANNING CASE NOS. PPD19-011 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN) / MSP19-002 (MASTER SIGN PLAN)
APPLICANT: JENNIFER CHAO**

PROJECT SUMMARY: On January 23, 2017, the Design Review Commission approved a Precise Plan of Plan (PPD), Planning Case No. PL-15-155, to allow for the construction of a three-story commercial building. The PPD has since expired. The applicant is applying a new PPD for the three-story commercial building with minor modifications to the previously approved façade. The application includes a Master Sign Plan (MSP) for the exterior signage.

The project site is zoned C-3 (Commercial and Limited Light Manufacturing) and R-1 (Single Family Residence) and has General Plan Land Use Designations of General Commercial and Low Density Residential. This project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Guidelines Section 15303, Class 3 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: ADOPT A RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SAN GABRIEL, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING PLANNING CASE NUMBERS PPD19-011 AND MSP19-002 TO ALLOW A NEW THREE-STORY COMMERCIAL BUILDING AND A MASTER SIGN PLAN AT 807-811 EAST WELLS STREET, SUBJECT TO THE RECOMMENDED CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL.

This item was presented by Planning Manager Steinkruger.

Planning Manager Steinkruger provided background information regarding this project stating the project site is 2 parcels and split zoning. The project dates back to 2014. In 2015, the Planning Commission hearing was continued to give the applicant and architect time to refine the project. In 2017, the Planning Commission approved the CUP for a parking reduction. The Design Review Commission reviewed and approved the PPD application. Construction needs to occur within 2 years of approval of the PPD. The building permit for the project was not pulled and the PPD has expired.

Chairman Cheng opened the public hearing.

Testimonies:

1. Garret Kaya – opposed
2. Belinda & Tobaiz Cristales, 1301 South Gladys Avenue, San Gabriel – opposed
3. Justin Wheeler, 1129 South Hidalgo Avenue, Alhambra – opposed
4. Stephanie Cristales Kaya, 1301 South Gladys Avenue, San Gabriel – opposed

There being no other speaker, Chairman Cheng closed the public hearing.

Mr. Alex Chang, architect, 8730 Huntington Drive, San Gabriel, stated that the plan check process has been approved. Building permits will get pulled in the early 2020 after the rain season. In the meantime, they are trying to make minor modifications to the project. Mr. Chang stated the 2nd floor is intended for the property owner. They are eliminating a lot of glass to make building more energy efficient. Mr. Chang stated they are changing the color of building from beige to light grayish stucco and darker tone accent.

The Commissioners questioned the energy efficiency of the building and want to ensure the building is sustainable.

Chairman Cheng stated the original design was better than the one being presented now.

Planning Manager Steinkruger suggested the original PPD could be re-applied without the modifications being proposed.

Commissioner Nadolney inquired about the exterior finish, color, the aluminum awnings and where the signage will be. She also questioned the material of guard rails on the 3rd floor.

Commissioner Sae-Low stated the project is very ambitious and the monochromatic board looks good and ties everything together.

Chairman Cheng questioned the usage space for each floor.

Mr. Chang explained that lower levels would be used for food and retail stores. The third floor would be for office use.

Terry To, sign designer with Signs Express, 1438 Santa Anita Avenue, South El Monte, came forward to answer questions regarding signage.

Commissioner Nadolney questioned the blade sign on the side of the building and stated it is not benefitting the building design. She recommended a sign that is more open, not a box sign.

Mr. Chang stated that because the building is on San Gabriel Boulevard and having a sign as the one being proposed would make the building standout. He suggested possibly making it more transparent to the original concept.

Commissioner Nadolney questioned the sign on the west elevation. She stated the sign on the south elevation does not look right and prefer they hang down off the guard rail.

Mr. Chang agreed to bring the sign down hanging from the canopy rather than on top of it.

Planning Manager Steinkruger stated that the Public Works Department required right-of-way improvements such as sidewalk, parkway improvements, and also possible traffic control improvements.

Mr. Chang stated that the requests have been reviewed by the Public Works Department and permits have been approved.

Commissioner Nadolney made the motion to approve the project subject to the additional conditions of approval which includes glazing, mullions, and City Architect's comments. Commissioner Sae- Low seconded. Motion passed with a vote of 4 ayes, 0 noes.

Commissioner Nadolney made a separate motion to continue the Master Sign Plan (MSP19-002) to a future hearing date to be determined. Vice-Chair Romo seconded the motion. Motion passed with a vote of 4 ayes, 0 noes.

6. STAFF ITEMS

A. 806- 824 SOUTH GLADYS AVENUE PLANNING CASE NO. PL-15-149 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN) APPLICANT: SAN GABRIEL AL REAL ESTATE LLC

PROJECT SUMMARY: At the April 22, 2019 Design Review Commission (DRC) meeting, the DRC requested that some items of the project be brought back to the Commission for review and comment. This is responding to the DRC direction on this item. Additional direction and/or comments will be incorporated into the Building Plan Check submittal.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: RECOMMEND THAT THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION PROVIDE COMMENTS ON THE PROJECT.

This item was presented by Planning Manager Steinkruger.

Planning Manager Steinkruger provided background of the project. This site used to be the home of the Mission Lodge Sanitarium up until around 2015. All of the buildings have been demolished.

Rich Koors, architect, 824 South Gladys Avenue, San Gabriel, answered questions regarding the project and addressed the comments made from the last meeting.

Commissioner Nadoleny questioned the type of elevators that will be used.

Mr. Koors stated the elevators are based on hydraulics not on traction. It uses a new with modern technology.

Vice-Chair Romo stated after reviewing last comments, she agreed with the idea of trees in planter boxes and the sizes.

Mr. Coors stated they are aiming for a hospitality feel creating an outdoor space with great landscaping also want to functionally operate as an extension of the indoors when climate permits.

Vice-Chair Romo stated the courtyards look cold and suggested warming them up with planting material possibly adding trellis, wall vines, or colored patio umbrellas.

Chairman Cheng thanked the applicants and stated it is a wonderful project.

**B. 1616 EUCLID AVENUE / 1619 WALNUT STREET – PROJECT PREVIEW
PLANNING CASE NO. PPD19-003 (PRECISE PLAN OF DESIGN)
APPLICANT: CREATIVE DESIGN ASSOCIATES**

PROJECT SUMMARY: This item is intended to provide information to the Design Review Commission about a proposed mixed-use project.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: RECOMMEND THAT THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION PROVIDE COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSED PROJECT.

This item was presented by Senior Planner Chang

Senior Planner Chang stated this project was brought before the Commission for a preview so Commissioners could provide feedback. The project consists of 38 apartment units and commercial space.

Chairman Cheng questioned the usage of each residential unit.

Kenneth Pang, architect, Creative Design Associates, stated all of the residential units are studios, and they are meant for rental only.

Mr. Pang explained the project stating they went for visual aesthetics and that they are trying to do something a bit more modern, geared towards a commercial look while keeping the neighbors privacy in mind.

Vice-Chair Romo questioned the storefronts of the building.

Mr. Pang stated that the developer is leaning more towards office use being that it is more suitable for the area.

Vice-Chair Romo agreed that if it is for office use then the design makes sense. She suggested looking at a project in Costa Mesa as an example for amenities.

Commissioner Sae-Low questioned the north elevation metal material and the monolithic look.

Mr. Pang stated they wanted the contrast to show the transition and if the Commission recommends, the applicant would re-evaluate the design approach.

Chairman Cheng agreed with the monolithic panels on the north elevation. He suggested using a wood element and mix the material.

Mr. Pang stated the materials differentiates the different functions of the building.

Commissioner Nadolney questioned the height between level 1 and 2.

Vice-Chair Romo questioned the shared space on the lower level. She stated the building should be secured for residents' use.

Mr. Pang stated that there were additional measures to provide more privacy.

Commissioner Nadolney suggested lowering the building height as much as possible.

Chairman Cheng questioned the ceiling height and suggested a 13 ft. ceiling height on the first floor, 9 ft. ceiling height for residential floors.

Vice-Chair Romo suggested adding a shared conference room.

Commissioner Nadolney suggested adding power and Wi-Fi in the courtyard.

Commissioner Sae-Low stated that the ground floor might get heavy shadows and suggested improvements.

7. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND CONFERENCE/MEETING REPORTS

Planning Manager Steinkruger stated the December meeting will be cancelled and a tentative meeting is scheduled for January 6, 2020.

8. ADJOURN DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION MEETING

Meeting adjourned to the next meeting at City Hall, 425 South Mission Drive, 2nd Floor, Council Chambers.



ERIKA ORTIZ, SECRETARY
DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION



RAYMOND CHENG, CHAIR
DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION