

**CITY OF SAN GABRIEL
DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING**

**MONDAY, OCTOBER 27, 2014
7:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Cheng called the regular meeting of the Design Review Commission to order at 7:00 p.m.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Chairman Cheng and Vice-Chair Beavers

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Commissioner Nadolney

STAFF PRESENT: Planning Manager Mark Gallatin, Assistant Planner Fang Zhou, Consultant City Architect Dale Brown, Jack L. Wong, Interim Community Development Director, and Design Review Commission Secretary Jackie Wong.

COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC:

None.

NEW BUSINESS

- 1. 400-420 W. Valley Blvd.**
Planning Case No. PL-14-063
Applicant: Eric Cheng (Chateau Operating Corp.)
Applicant: Kollin Altomare Architects (KAA)

Project Summary: This is a second preview of a proposed five story mixed-use development with 61,120 sq. ft. of commercial space and 126 residential units.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission review the plans and provide direction to staff and the project architects.

DRC RESPONSE:

This project was introduced by Planning Manager Mark Gallatin. Tonight's presentation was based on the previous meeting that incorporated additional comments and options from the City Architect which were then developed further by the project team.

Mr. Brian Husting, lead project architect, gave the presentation to the Commission on the general approach and design of the project. He also requested Mr. Dale Brown, City Architect, to elaborate on some of his comments.

Mr. Brown commended the architects for their work. He suggested having linear openings on the building and using contrasting elements to puncture its massing to make it more elegant. He stated that the architects took a certain design approach last time and reinterpreted it but feel that these

elements could still get better. He added that he liked how the balconies come out, the white base that comes across, how the glazing comes down, how the treatment at the top is handled well, and that the strongest part of the project is where the restaurant is. He suggested having landscaping on some of the pieces like on the two towers on each end of the building. He added that the canopy is very light and will be great as an outdoor dining area. He added that the entry does a good job in blending vehicular and pedestrian entry.

Vice-Chair Rhett Beavers thanked the project team for including the Commission and the City Architect's comments into the revised design. He stated that he loves it a whole lot more and found the creation of thresholds attractive with the addition of trellises that come across the towers. This gives a sense of arrival. He suggested breaking up the white band on the bottom so as not to look continuous. He also added that the differentiation in massing was appropriate rather than using objects to achieve it.

Chairman Raymond Cheng stated that the Commission was harsh on the project team at the last meeting but commended them for being open to suggestions and trying different approaches. He stated that the Commission would like to help the team move in the right direction. He added that the building's elevation is very strong and that the residential portion and parking circulation are very clear. They all have reason and meaning, which he really likes. He also stated that there are still some certain refinements that can be done like the window trimmings. He stated that he likes the glass towers and the stair cases and suggested that using the correct lighting in the main entry could create a great statement at night. He stated that the project is going in the right direction and it is approvable with minor refinements to the details.

Planning Manager Gallatin asked Mr. Eric Chen, applicant, if he could share information about their public art program. Mr. Chen stated that the team mainly focused on the concept design first. Mr. Michael Kollin, project architect, stated that they will focus on the public art program and the sign program at a later time.

DRC ACTION:

None.

2. 101-111 W. Valley Blvd.

Planning Case No. PL-14-060

Applicant: Tony Cheng (Landwin Corp)

Applicant: Kollin Altomare Architects (KAA)

Project Summary: This was an update for the proposed construction of a Hyatt Place hotel on Valley Boulevard with 222 rooms, approximately 48,795 sq. ft. of commercial space and 87 residential units.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Design Review Commission review the plans and provide direction to staff and the project architects.

DRC RESPONSE:

This preview was introduced by Planning Manager Mark Gallatin.

Mr. Brian Husting, lead project architect, gave the presentation to the Commission on the project's third revision to the approach and design.

Mr. Brown, City Architect, stated that the entrances should be treated in a very light manner to differentiate masses alongside Valley Blvd. He suggested maintaining the base along it and to make sure it is done in the proper way. He suggested making the façade have subtle gradation and making the pilasters have finer patterns instead of larger patterns to break up the massing of the building. Some have deep patterns and have glazing that comes down past the vertical elements. He also suggested that the base does not go continuously.

Chairman Cheng felt that the building is extremely heavy. He stated that he sees more masonry than glass. It is a whole block of heavy masonry even when the building has lighter color. He feared that none of the glazing would stand out. He stated that he has no idea what is behind the building by looking at it from the outside. He stated that he didn't see a clear delineation of function to make a statement and identification. He suggested removing the heavy massing.

The Commissioners asked what type of stone will be used on the building's exterior. Mr. Husting stated a combination of natural stone and concrete like stucco.

Vice-Chair Beavers stated that he liked Mr. Brown's design that breaks the horizontal form and shows how the light comes in at night. Mr. Brown's design also has really a nice rhythm of glass elements without that long horizontal box frame. He felt that the current design is disruptive, jarring, not very elegant, and heavy. He also finds the frame beyond the first floor disconcerting.

The Commissioners and Mr. Brown felt that the building colors do not have to change. They also felt the need to meet again with the applicant and the design team to work on the approach and design as well as guide the project in the right direction. The Commissioners agreed to hold a special meeting on Monday, November 10 to discuss this project further. The project team agreed to make the modifications by that time.

Mr. Husting proceeded to discuss the public art package for the project.

Vice-Chair Beavers suggested using mobile art pieces because they are kinetic. People are fascinated with movement since childbirth and they catch the eyes the most. He suggested bringing in things that people can look at that do things to catch people's attention and interest.

In closing, Chairman Cheng addressed the project team that the Commission wants to make sure they will have an end product that they should be proud of. He recognized there is a deadline but also acknowledged the team has come a long way from last year. He stated that this project is getting very close to where it should be.

DRC ACTION:
None.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:
None.

COMMENTS BY STAFF:
None.

COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS:
None.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairman Cheng adjourned the meeting at 9:12p.m. to a special Design Review Commission meeting on Monday, November 10, 2014 at 12:30p.m.

* * * * *

The complete text of the Design Review Commission meeting minutes is available on tape and may be reviewed within 90 days after the meeting in the Community Development Department office at City Hall during regular business hours.

Raymond Cheng, Chairman
San Gabriel Design Review Commission

ATTEST: _____
Jackie Wong
San Gabriel Design Review Commission Secretary